



AGENDA ITEM: 13
DATE OF MEETING: July 23, 2015
ACTION: _____
INFORMATION: X

MEDIA CAMPAIGN EVALUATION

SUMMARY

NORC at the University of Chicago will present an overview of its evaluation of the effectiveness of the *Talk. Read. Sing.*[®] campaign. The evaluation was designed to determine whether parents and other child caregivers with greater exposure to the campaign are more likely to talk, read, and sing to the children in their care.

BACKGROUND

At its April 24, 2014, meeting, the Commission authorized \$8.88 million to extend First 5 California's *Talk. Read. Sing.*[®] media campaign. Runyon Salzman Einhorn (Runyon) was the contractor selected to oversee the additional purchase of media time for the campaign.

As part of the Runyon contract, First 5 California also required an evaluation to be performed to assess the effectiveness/impact of the *Talk. Read. Sing.*[®] campaign. Runyon subcontracted the evaluation requirement to NORC at the University of Chicago. NORC conducted a thorough evaluation of the campaign, and Larry Bye and Alyssa Ghirardelli of NORC will report on its findings.

EVALUATION – KEY FINDINGS

The NORC Evaluation Report presents results from First 5 California's *Talk. Read. Sing.*[®] campaign, which ran from March through June 2014, and again from November 2014 through January 2015. Study data were collected via web survey of the target audience, which consisted of California parents and other caregivers of children ages 0 to 5. Approximately 1,000 interviews were completed between April and May 2015. The survey involved the use of both an opt-in panel combined with a population-based panel to increase the generalizability of the findings.

Key findings include:

- 60 percent of target audience members could recall a First 5 California *Talk. Read. Sing.*[®] campaign TV ad on an unaided basis or by recognition. A third could recall or recognize a radio ad. Almost two-thirds (64.9 percent) reported either unaided recall or recognition of a TV or radio ad.
- Nearly 4-in-10 of target audience members who reported ad recognition said they had engaged in interpersonal conversation about the issue. Nearly 6-in-10 reported talking with a family member about the issue, 4-in-10 reported talking with friends, and more than a quarter reported talking with a health care provider.
- 38 percent reported use of the First 5 California Parent Website to get additional information and assistance on the issue.
- Campaign exposure was associated with an increased propensity to engage in all three behaviors (talking, reading, and singing). This was after the study controlled for other potentially important influences on these behaviors.
- The findings provide positive evidence of behavioral effects, which is relatively unusual in the case of short-term social marketing campaigns.

First 5 California *Talk. Read. Sing.*[®] Campaign Evaluation

Study Design and Key
Findings



Larry Bye,
Senior Fellow

Alyssa Ghirardelli,
Research Scientist

NORC

at the UNIVERSITY of CHICAGO

- The goal of the First 5 California *Talk. Read. Sing.*[®] campaign was to:
 - Inspire and empower parents and caregivers to engage with children ages 0 to 5 to talk, read, and sing more frequently to their children
 - Empower parents and caregivers to make them feel they can influence their children's lives to positively impact their future

- The campaign objectives appeared to connect with parent and caregiver control beliefs and perceived power
- Promotion of talking, reading, and singing while tapping into control beliefs and perceived power which strengthens self-efficacy
- Delivered early intervention messages through television and radio advertising

- NORC assessed the effectiveness of the campaign with a post-only cross-sectional survey design.
 - The web-based survey was completed April-May 2015
 - Participants were recruited through a population-based panel as well as opt-in convenience panels

Main study question:

- Were parents with greater exposure to the *Talk. Read. Sing.*[®] campaign more likely to report talking, reading, and singing to their children, after adjusting for risk and other factors?

Study Purpose and Background Continued

Other key research questions, developed jointly by NORC, RSE, and First 5 California, included:

- What proportion of the respondents in the sample recall or recognize the campaign?
- Do respondents who have higher campaign recall also have more knowledge about the topic being addressed by the campaign?
- Did the campaign inspire and empower parents to engage with their young children?

The final study sample combined a population probability-based sample of 282 with 712 participants from opt-in convenience panels for a total sample of $n = 994$

- The population-level sample enabled NORC to establish a weighting strategy for the opt-in sample
- The opt-in sample was scientifically calibrated and adjusted based on demographic characteristics of the population-based group and the two were aggregated
- Respondents were screened to ensure they were parents of at least one child under the age of 6

Two survey measures were used to determine exposure to the campaign:

- Unaided recall
- Recognition
- **Unaided recall** requires respondents to recall the ad(s) from a generic description of the category of ads that were used in the campaign
- **Recognition** requires that respondents confirm past exposure after seeing or hearing the ads
- Administered in English and Spanish

Study Methodology: Survey Measures Continued

- To identify knowledge, behavior, and risk factor issues and existing measures, NORC and RSE conducted an extensive review of child development literature.
- Identified questions through existing surveys:
 - 2011-2012 California Health Interview Survey
 - 2011 Los Angeles County Health Survey
 - 2011 Survey of Los Angeles County WIC Parents
 - CUBS: Alaska Childhood Understanding Behaviors Survey, PRAMS 3-year-olds
 - SLAITS, National Survey of Early Childhood Health
 - What Grown-Ups Understand about Child Development: A National Benchmark Survey.

Study Methodology: Data Analysis

- After data collection, NORC cleaned, coded, and, weighted the dataset
- Conducted descriptive analysis
- Used advanced linear regression methods to assess the relationship between ad exposure and the behavioral outcomes by controlling for influences other than ad exposure
- Media buy data helped examine spending differences and ad recall/recognition rates

Respondent Demographic Characteristics

- Nearly half (48%) of respondents from the combined sample fell between ages 25 and 34, while about another third fell between ages 35 and 44
- Women accounted for 56% of the combined sample
- Half of respondents were Hispanic (51%), while about a third (30%) were White and 4% were Non-Hispanic Blacks
- A large majority (84%) of respondents completed the survey in English

Respondent Demographic Characteristics Continued

- Data on education, income, and marital status of sample respondents

	High School or Less	Some College	College Degree
Education	41.5%	28.1%	30.4%
	< \$40K/year	\$40-85K/year	>\$85K/year
Income	37.2%	35.2%	32.1%
	Married	Living Together	Not Currently Partnered
Marital Status	73%	14%	13%

- Possibly higher than usual proportion of married respondents (CHIS 51-59% for HH \geq 3)

Respondent Demographic Characteristics Continued

- In the combined sample:
 - About 1-in-5 respondents had infants (18%)
 - Almost half (44%) had toddlers ages 1 to 2
 - 2-in-3 had preschoolers ages 3 to 5 (66%)
- 61% of respondents were currently working

Respondent Demographic Characteristics Continued

Government Program Usage		
Type of Program	n	%
Federal, State, or local assistance for childcare	34	3.4
MediCal	289	29.1
WIC	341	34.3
CalFresh/EBT/Food Stamps	169	17.0
No support received	514	51.7

- Respondents with similar MediCal usage to households with 5 - 6 persons (CHIS 17.5%% for HH size 3, 16.4% HH size 4, 25.3% HH size 5, 33.2% HH size 6)

- Among respondents, the more traditional forms of media consumption – television and broadcast radio – were the media most frequently used on a daily basis over a 30 day period.
 - 54% viewed video content on television at home at least once a day
 - 23% viewed video content on TV “a few times a week”
 - 34% viewed video content on the internet
 - 48% listened to AM/FM broadcast radio at least once per day
 - 25% listened to broadcast radio “a few times a week”

Risk and Protective Factors: Depression and Coping

- Many respondents indicated moderate to high satisfaction with their own lives and with their responsibilities as parents, but not overwhelmingly. Over half (53%) reported feeling they cope with the day to day demands of parenthood very well and 45% somewhat well or not very well.
- 36% of respondents answered they had “felt down, depressed, or hopeless” on “several days/more than half the days”

Representation of California Media Markets in Sample

- With 49% of respondents, Los Angeles was by far the most represented market in the combined sample.
- The other most highly represented markets were:
 - San Francisco-Oakland-San Jose (15.4 percent)
 - San Diego (11.8 percent)
 - Sacramento-Stockton-Modesto (10.6 percent)
 - Fresno-Visalia (7.4 percent)
- A comparison of the sample distribution with how the general California population is distributed across the DMAs shows that the two are roughly in alignment.

- To demonstrate unaided recall, respondents' descriptions of ads they had seen had to be coded as "likely" or "very likely" referring the First 5 California *Talk. Read. Sing.*[®] advertisements
- More than a third (36%) of respondents recalled seeing First 5 California *Talk. Read. Sing.*[®] TV ads
- 5% percent recalled hearing radio ads

- Immediately following questions testing for unaided recall, the survey presented respondents with the actual First 5 California *Talk. Read. Sing.*[®] ads embedded into the survey and asked whether respondents, upon seeing or hearing them, recognized the ads from previous exposure
- 46% no recognition
- 54% recognized at least one ad after viewing or hearing all of them
- A small percentage (7%) recognized all four ads

Advertising Recognition

Type and Amount of Ad Recognition	n	%
No Recognition	457	46.0
TV Advertisement: "Anthem"	326	32.8
TV Advertisement: "Successful Futures"	335	33.7
Radio Advertisement: "Baby Talk"	201	20.2
Radio Advertisement: "Conversations"	231	23.2
At Least One Ad (any ad)	537	54.0
TV Only and No Radio	232	23.4
Radio Only and No TV	86	8.6
Four Ads (all ads)	65	6.6

- Overall, 60% of respondents reported either unaided recall or recognition of a *Talk. Read. Sing.*[®] television ad
- About a third (33%) of respondents reported either unaided recall or recognition of a *Talk. Read. Sing.*[®] radio ad
- Nearly 2 out of 3 (65%) respondents reported either recall or recognition of a *Talk. Read. Sing.*[®] television or radio ad

Reported Campaign Effects

- Almost 3 out of 4 (74%) respondents recognizing the ads reported that the ads led them to talk, read, and sing more with their children
- 38% percent of respondents recognizing the ads said they visited the First 5 California parent website as a result, and most (70%) of them said the site provided “a lot” of help (with 26% saying it was “somewhat” helpful)

- Many respondents that recognized the ads reported that the ads led them to talk with someone about what parents should do with their children:
 - 59% with family members
 - 43% with friends
 - 27% with healthcare provider

- Mixed results in terms of knowledge with respondents having correct answers in general areas about brain development and the importance of talking, reading, and singing
- However, incorrect answers on items such as:
 - “A child’s ability to learn is pretty much set from birth and can’t be improved or lowered by how often their parents read with them”:
 - 22% answered incorrectly
 - 9% said they didn’t know

- Other items with incorrect responses:
 - “Children get equal benefits from hearing someone on TV as from hearing someone in the same room reading to them”:
 - more than a third (36%) answered incorrectly
 - 16% said they didn’t know the answer
 - “Children under the age of 2 should learn to use electronic devices...to help them be more prepared for school”:
 - 20 % answered incorrectly
 - 18 % said they didn’t know the answer

- Analysis of the descriptive data showed **no consistent differences** in number of correct responses to knowledge items between those respondents who recalled or recognized the ads and those who did not.

- To assess effectiveness of the campaign, parents were asked about how often they perform the behaviors promoted in the ads
- Both “times per week” and “number of minutes” per week were collected for each of the behaviors: talking, reading, and singing

- Parents with recognition read significantly more with their children
- Those with recognition of the First 5 California ads reported reading about **1 time more over the week and the weekend days**
- As with reading, parents with recall or recognition reported singing about **1 more time during both the week days and the weekend days**
- There were no statistical differences for talking behavior for those exposed to the campaign and those not exposed

Evidence of Effectiveness: Campaign Effects

- Multiple regression analysis models for each of the three behaviors
- Each fairly robust in their ability to explain variance in the behavioral outcomes
- All three models were statistically significant
- The results provide evidence that ad recall and recognition are associated with **all three** behaviors the campaign sought to influence
- Parents with higher self-efficacy scores reported higher frequencies of all *Talk. Read. Sing.*[®] behaviors

Evidence of Effectiveness: Campaign Effects

Parents with

- **unaided recall of the radio ads**
- **recognition of the television ads**
 - talk significantly more to their children
 - read significantly more to their children
- **unaided recall of the TV ads and the radio ads**
 - sing more often to their young children

- Parents with higher levels of self-efficacy for the behaviors are engaging in talking and reading behaviors more often
- Other findings from regression are present and are available in the report appendices
 - Findings can inform future campaign directions
 - Formative research may help further examine these relationships
 - Dataset is rich and offers additional analysis opportunities

- The findings suggest that the campaign has been effective in impacting all three behaviors of interest.
 - The findings are not definitive
 - Not able to establish a causal relationship between the campaign and the behaviors
 - Single survey, non-experimental research design
 - Yet, results are positive in that they provide some evidence of behavioral effects
 - Relatively unusual in the case of short-term social marketing campaigns

Evaluation Findings Recap

- 60% of target audience members could recall a First 5 California *Talk. Read. Sing.*® TV ad on an unaided basis or by recognition
- A third recognized or recalled a radio ad
- Almost two-thirds (65%) reported *either* unaided recall or recognition of a TV *or* radio ad
- Quite high compared to most social marketing campaigns
- Specifically unaided recall of television ads by 36% of the target audience is impressive since it is a very demanding measure of recall

- Large numbers of respondents reporting ad recognition also reported that the campaign influenced their *Talk. Read. Sing.*[®] behaviors
- Both cross-tabular analysis and more robust regression analysis showed evidence that ad recall or recognition resulted in higher frequency of talking, reading, and singing
- This suggests campaign effectiveness in the behavioral domain, something that is often not the case with social marketing campaigns mounted on a short term basis

- The evaluation also suggests that the campaign influenced both interpersonal conversations about the issues as well as help-seeking through the First 5 California parent website
 - 38% percent reported use of the website
 - Nearly 6-in-10 reported talking with a family member about the issue
 - 4-in-10 reported talking with friends
 - More than a quarter reported talking with a health care provider

- It is somewhat surprising that we found no evidence of knowledge differences between those who reported exposure to the campaign and those that did not.
 - Additional analysis may lead us to draw a different conclusion
 - Nevertheless, the knowledge results provide useful information about what the main gaps are and these data can be used for planning future public education and communication efforts

Questions and Discussion

Thank You!



NORC
at the UNIVERSITY of CHICAGO

 insight for informed decisions™