



## California Children and Families Commission Meeting

October 30, 2024

### MEETING MINUTES

#### Item 1 – Opening Remarks

Chair Albright called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m.

Commissioners Present:       Katie Albright  
  Elsa Jimenez  
  Vivian Velasco Paz  
  Shana Hazan  
  Jackie Majors  
  Lori Risso

Ex Officio Member Present:   None

#### CLOSED SESSION

Report Out of Closed Session:

The Commission met during Closed Session. No action was taken.

Director Wong opened the meeting with a Tribal Land Acknowledgment.

Chair Albright began her remarks by announcing Item 7 on the agenda will be moved up as requested by Supervisor Ellenberg.

#### First 5 California Executive Director Report

Director Wong provided programmatic and administrative updates about key activities First 5 California (F5CA) staff have engaged in since the August 22, 2024, Commission Meeting. Program updates include relevant highlights, rather than a summary of all staff work, and are framed by the [Strategic Priority Areas](#) and [Theory of Change System Levers](#).

#### First 5 Association Executive Director Report

Director Makdessian provided a few updates including thanking the Commission for providing updates on the Strategic Plan and the interaction with Arabella Advisors, celebrating the one-year anniversary of the online Medi-Cal Learning Community, and local county experiences focused on family planning.

## **Item 1 – Public Comment**

Courtney Armstrong, Director of Government Affairs, First 5 Association: Ms. Armstrong referenced the release of the County Playbook that Catbird Strategies is putting together and provided additional context from the Association’s perspective. Ms. Armstrong also referenced a report based on the Medi-Cal Learning Community outlining a lot of the work that's in progress.

Anna Bauer, Executive Director, First 5 Butte County: Ms. Bauer stated IMPACT dollars go directly to the County Office of Education and the need for a timeline for what the future funding is to retain staff in January 2025.

## **Item 2 – Public Comment**

Doug Major, Optometric Care Associates: Mr. Major stated children need more access to vision care and there are very few people advocating for them. Mr. Major stated California is 51<sup>st</sup> in the nation for access to children's vision care. Mr. Major hopes F5CA will prioritize this issue with the Department of Healthcare Services.

Dan Berman, Administrative Analyst, First 5 Humboldt: Mr. Berman shared there has been a request to include the current budget financial statements and the most recent audit on the F5CA website and to make them more accessible to the public.

Francine Rodd, Executive Director, First 5 Monterey: Ms. Rodd stated IMPACT could really use a deep dive with the counties to help design what's going to make the most sense moving forward as well as the Kit for New Parents. Ms. Rodd stated she would like to see the physical kit as well as an online version.

## **Action Item 7 – Public Relations Campaign**

### **Susan Ellenberg, President, Santa Clara Board of Supervisors/First 5 Santa Clara**

**Commissioner:** Supervisor Ellenberg provided a PowerPoint presentation focused on shifting the narrative around childcare from one of largely individual parental responsibility to a public good, and an economic necessity.

## **Public Education and Outreach Advisory Committee Comments**

Commissioner Majors stated the work Supervisor Ellenberg presented aligns with the work F5CA is doing and the importance of it being aligned, Commissioner Majors also referred to the resources and family planning “red folder” Director Makdessian referenced during his report and the importance of our role as community caregivers of our youngest California citizens and getting California to continue to increase investments in childcare.

## **Commissioner Comments**

Chair Albright asked Supervisor Ellenberg to elaborate on how the National Aeronautics and Space Administration (NASA) became involved in childcare. Supervisor Ellenberg stated NASA in Santa Clara County has been providing on-site childcare for more than 30 years because it's a business decision and a positive investment that has helped attract and retain employees.

Supervisor Ellenberg stated employer-based childcare is not the end game and by highlighting businesses that do provide childcare is an example of why childcare is important to the business model.

Vice Chair Hazan asked when referencing childcare, is it specific to babies up to elementary school age or was it more broad. Supervisor Ellenberg stated the focus is children ages 0–2, particularly for home-based childcare providers and parents that need full day care. There will still be a big demand for parents with children ages 3–5 that need full day care outside of the school system.

### **Action Item 7 – Public Relations Campaign Continued**

Dr. Angelo Williams, Chief Deputy Director, F5CA provided a PowerPoint presentation on the Raise CA Strong: Childcare Affordability Campaign. Highlights included:

- Data Informed/Priority Focused
- Parents/Caregivers with higher ACEs
- Focus Audiences
- Key Findings/Takeaways
- Purpose/Strategy
- Next Steps/Commission Action/Scope of Work

### **Public Comment**

The following speakers spoke in support of the Raise CA Strong campaign:

LaWanda Wesley, Government Relations, Child Care Resource Center

Adonai Mack, Chief Executive Officer, Child Action, Inc.

Jennifer Cloyd, Executive Director, First 5 Santa Clara

Samantha Bond, Executive Director, First 5 Lake

Melody Easton, Executive Director, First 5 Nevada

Nicole Hinton, Executive Director, First 5 Modoc

Townley Saye, Executive Director, First 5 Mendocino

Avo Makdessian, Executive Director, First 5 Association: Name specificity (solution agnostic) and uplifting the entire First 5 Network profile.

### **Virtual Public Comment**

Eva Rivera, Policy Director, Children's Partnership

### **Commissioner Comments**

Commissioner Risso stated the message from the counties is clear on coordination and collaboration with the Raise CA Strong campaign.

Commissioner Fabi reinforced the need to fulfill the Proposition 10 mandate.

Vice Chair Hazan asked if raising awareness is sufficient and asked what were the intended goals of the campaign. Dr. Williams stated the campaign is focused on the urgency around solutions and creating a collective impact response not only oriented towards awareness, but also towards action. Vice Chair Hazan encouraged identifying metrics that are tied to outcomes.

Commissioner Majors stated that the investment is essential, childcare is an urgent public health care crisis that needs to move forward, and we need to engage unexpected advocates to start supporting, voting, and elevating the impact of childcare on our economy.

**MOTION/ACTION:** Commissioner Jimenez moved to approved \$4 million over 3 years from the Media account for a public relations contract to support F5CA's Young Child Policy Agenda. The motion was seconded by Vice Chair Hazan.

**VOTE:** The motion was unanimously approved by the Commission.

### **Action Item 3 – Consent Calendar**

Samantha Bond, Executive Director, First 5 Lake requested the August 22, 2024, meeting minutes be pulled from the Consent Calendar. They were not approved as part of the Consent Calendar. The August 22, 2024, meeting minutes will be discussed separately.

**MOTION/ACTION:** Vice Chair Hazan moved to approve the Consent Calendar. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Jimenez.

**VOTE:** The motion was unanimously approved by the Commission.

### **Public Comment**

Samantha Bond, Executive Director, First 5 Lake provided name clarification for First 5 Mendocino Executive Director Townley Saye and requested to list all the names of the members of the public who spoke in support of Information Item 11 – First 5 Association Emergency Stabilization Funding Request.

Courtney Armstrong, Director of Government Affairs, First 5 Association offered to provide a list of names that spoke during public comment in support of the First 5 Association Emergency Stabilization Funding Request. Ms. Armstrong requested clarification around ADA requirements for letters that are to be posted to the website to ensure compliance in the future.

Chair Albright stated F5CA staff will examine how letters might be shared in the future.

The meeting minutes for August 21, 2024, and August 22, 2024, were pulled from the Consent Calendar. August 21, 2024, meeting minutes will be voted upon as there was not a request to pull them from the Consent Calendar. The August 22, 2024, meeting minutes will be revised and included in the January 30, 2025, Consent Calendar.

**MOTION/ACTION:** Vice Chair Hazan moved to approve the August 21, 2024, Roundtable Discussion meeting minutes. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Paz.

**VOTE:** The motion was unanimously approved by the Commission.

#### **Information Item 4 – Financial Update**

Commissioner Jimenez stated the Fiscal and Audits Advisory Committee met on September 30, 2024, to review and discuss the decline in consumption and the percentage decrease year over year as per the California Department of Tax & Fee Administration’s (CDTFA) webpage data. The Committee discussed statute language around the Unallocated account and what funds can be expended towards. Staff reshared a presentation that was presented to the Commission earlier this year providing background, and the intent of the current SPCFA program that ends June 30, 2025. The Committee discussed inviting the First 5 Association to a series of meetings to further discuss the First 5 County Emergency Stabilization Fund Proposal.

Marcia Thomas, Director of Fiscal Services, provided an update on F5CA’s financial status. Highlights included:

- Year End Updates
- Next Steps
- Completion Date for Review of Closing Accounting Numbers
- Flow of Projections
- Revenue Projections
- Projected Fund Balances
- FY 2023–24 Proposition 10 Revenue
- Proposition 10 Transfers from California Department of Tax & Fee Administration
- 4 Year History of Proposition 10 Revenue
- Revenue Factors
- Assembly Bill 3218 (Unflavored Tobacco List) Goes into Effect January 1, 2025

#### **Commissioner Comments**

None.

#### **Public Comment**

Avo Makdessian, Executive Director, First 5 Association stated he looks forward to learning more about the next steps related to the Stabilization Fund proposal. Mr. Makdessian stated the Association would like to see more analysis on the projected 3% revenue decline due to Senate Bill 3218 going into effect on January 1, 2025.

Angie Dillon-Shore, Executive Director, First 5 Sonoma urged F5CA to bring the \$25 million stabilization fund proposal to the January Commission meeting for approval by the State Commission.

Mary Ann Hansen, Executive Director, First 5 Humboldt urged F5CA to bring the stabilization proposal back to the January meeting for a vote.

Townley Saye, Executive Director, First 5 Mendocino reiterated to the Commission their authority to transfer their 20% to an allocated fund to meet the priorities at the local level as needed.

Jennifer Cloyd, Executive Director, First 5 Santa Clara stated there is an urgent need for stabilization funding and at some point, some of our small counties won't be able to rebuild.

Ana Apodaca, Government Affairs and Policy Officer, First 5 Alameda asked the Commission to commit to bring back the stabilization fund for action and approval at the January meeting.

Anna Bauer, Executive Director, First 5 Butte stated the perception in the community is that F5CA is a critical funder and convener and that continues to be the expectation of our communities and without stabilization it compromises the ability to do the prevention work in our communities.

Dan Berman, Administrative Analyst, First 5 Humboldt stated slide 6 shows projections in the future, and the interest line, has interest and investment returns as identical amounts across the entire table, as the net fund balance, goes from \$150 million to \$40 million, FY 2027–28, has net expenditures dropping by 50% in a year, Mr. Berman encouraged the Commission not to drop expenditures by 50% in a year.

Lucas Frerichs, Chair, Yolo Board of Supervisors/First 5 Yolo Commissioner respectfully asked the Commission to agendize a \$25 million stabilization fund at the January 2025 Commission meeting.

Jenna Flush, Business Manager, First 5 Mendocino spoke in support of the \$25 million stabilization fund.

Karen Pautz, Executive Director, First 5 Siskiyou also encouraged the Commission to support the \$25 million stabilization fund request and bring it to the January 2025 Commission meeting.

Marcia Thomas, Director, Fiscal Services Office responded to Mr. Berman's question and stated the Department of Finance audits F5CA financials and are posted on the Department of Finance's website. Ms. Thomas stated that the Commission has not approved or planned for expenditures past FY 2027–28.

### **Information Item 5 – UNFINISHED BUSINESS: State and Federal Budget and Legislative Update**

Commissioner Fabi stated the Public Policy Advisory Committee met on October 2, 2024, and received legislative updates, state budget updates, and federal budget updates. The legislative update outlined how the F5CA legislative agenda is firmly aligned with advocacy efforts focused on key policy initiatives that support the well-being of California's youngest residents. Bills related to the North Star and Audacious Goal were discussed including AB 1895, AB 2319, SB 1112, AB 1967, and SB 1126. Commissioners were updated on the 2024 Budget Act allocations.

Jorge De La Cruz, Director, External & Governmental Affairs shared a PowerPoint presentation. Highlights included:

- Legislative Update
- State Budget Update
- Federal Budget Update

### **Commissioner Comments**

Commissioner Fabi thanked F5CA and the Governmental Affairs team for their advocacy efforts and ensuring goods and services continue to be available to California's children and families.

Chair Albright mentioned AB 1799, Child Abuse Reporting, is one to keep an eye on as it specifically focuses on understanding the definition of neglect which is going to impact the children and families that F5CA supports.

### **Public Comment**

None.

### **Information Item 6 – Small Population County Stabilization Funding**

Commissioner Risso stated the Program and Evaluation Advisory Committee met on October 7, 2024, and discussed the role of the Committee based on a conversation with the Attorney General's office and have updated the program and evaluation operations. The Committee discussed F5CA's strategic efforts including F5CA's site visits, home visiting, IMPACT, small county amendments, and small population county funding.

Dr. Martha Dominguez-Brinkley provided a PowerPoint presentation. Highlights included:

- Update of current grants in place
- The process that will inform the next funding cycle
- First 5 Modoc presentation on a collective impact approach

Nicole Hinton, Executive Director, First 5 Modoc began her remarks by sharing handouts that are given to any person that walks into their front office lobby area, which is located at Modoc Joint Unified School District. The handout includes general information about their Hub, Dolly Parton's Imagination Library, First 5 Modoc's community health worker, and the parent powered text program.

Ms. Hinton provided a PowerPoint presentation. Highlights included:

- First 5 Modoc County Overview/Background/History
- Investments
- Systems Change

- Looking Ahead

### **Commissioner Comments**

Chair Albright requested clarification on an allocation versus a grant. Ms. Hinton stated SPCFA was a direct allocation in the past., and the counties would get so much money up front, and at the end of the year they would have a giant balance left, and that's what we anticipated getting in the end and then it changed to a grant-based system which has been very difficult to navigate. Chair Albright asked if it was reverting back to an allocation. Director Wong stated allocations, according to several First 5 CA Chief Counsels, are not in compliance with our statutory authority so F5CA tried contracting, which took too long because of the challenges dealing control agencies. In an effort to address these challenges, First 5 Chief Counsel recommended using grants to implement the SPCFA program.

Vice Chair Hazan asked what some of the challenges are with the grant structure. Ms. Hinton stated it doesn't allow for flexibility especially when it comes to a systems change budget when things can change very quickly. It's other money and unrestricted funds that are being used to accomplish the work.

### **Public Comment**

Avo Makdessian, Executive Director, First 5 Association emphasized that SPCFA is foundational funding for twenty-one small counties and is meant to correct a flaw in Proposition 10. Mr. Makdessian stated the best way to make SPCFA more equitable, efficient, and effective is to make it an allocation. By creating a grant program, it is essentially putting more burden on the counties that have the least capacity.

Samantha Bond, Executive Director, First 5 Lake stated one of the biggest asks small counties had was a timeline for when longer discussions could be had around small county needs and flexibilities, and it came as a bit of a surprise to see this item on the agenda. Ms. Bond highlighted the data around race and race equity within small county communities. Ms. Bond stated SPCFA is an equitable investment and hopes F5CA will continue to invest in SPCFA.

Townley Saye, Executive Director, First 5 Mendocino encouraged the Commission to fund SPCFA as an allocation that continues the commitment towards achieving equitable access to resources while also collaborating with the Association to co-create the stabilization fund.

Mary Ann Hansen, Executive Director, First 5 Humboldt expressed concern over the renaming of the augmentation fund to stabilization which could be perceived by stakeholders to obfuscate opposition to the First 5 Association stabilization proposal and is a continuation of a correction to an error in the original policy and statute. Ms. Hansen urged the Commission to continue support of small counties in a streamlined process with as few barriers as possible.

Amy Broadhurst, Executive Director, First 5 Alpine urged the Commission to think about the funding as being a flawed law, and not something to stabilize.



Fabiola González, Executive Director, First 5 Fresno/First 5 Association President underscored the use of the word stabilization and how it could be perceived and to recognize it as a flaw in the statute and reimagine how to do SPCFA differently.

Melody Easton, Executive Director, First 5 Nevada stated the SPCFA foundational funding allows small counties to have a seat at the table with other stakeholders to think about ongoing sustainability for small counties and other funded partners and urged the Commission to continue to look at this funding as key foundational support for our organizations.

### **Commissioner Comments**

Commissioner Paz stated she understands the struggle rural counties have and commends the work being done.

Commissioner Jimenez encouraged small counties, First 5 CA staff, and the Commission to reimagine what the future of funding could look like, how it's framed/labeled, and more importantly, how to disperse funding more equitably.

Vice Chair Hazan acknowledged the more we ask counties to do in terms of grant writing and reporting, and all the administrative tasks, the less they can focus on the systems change work and drive impact in your communities.

### **Item 10 – Adjournment**

Chair Albright adjourned the meeting at 4:00 p.m.

The next scheduled Commission meeting is January 30, 2025.